

## NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF 311 California Street, Suite 510 CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ. San Francisco, CA 94104

T 415.391.3212

Dear Public Enforcement Agencies:

F 415.391.3245

As You Sow ("AYS") is a non-profit foundation organized under California's Non-Profit Public Benefit Corporation Law. AYS is dedicated to, among other causes, the protection of the environment, the promotion of human health, the improvement of worker and consumer safety, and environmental education.

AYS has documented violations of California's Safe Drinking Water & Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), codified at Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. This letter serves to provide AYS' notification of these violations to the public enforcement agencies and to the violator. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, AYS intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

A summary of the statute and its implementing regulations, which was prepared by the lead agency designated under the statute, is enclosed with the copy of this notice served upon the violator. The specific details of the violations that are the subject of this notice are provided below.

Alleged violator. The name of the violator covered by this notice is IDEASPHERE, INC. doing business as TWINLAB CORPORATION and NATURE'S HERBS, INC. ("IdeaSphere").

Chemicals. These violations involve exposures to lead and lead compounds from the products listed below. On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

Consumer products. The products that are the subject of this notice are herbs and herbal products, traditional patent medicines, bulk herbs, infusions, extracted powders, tea pills, traditional pills, patent formulas, bulk teas, liquid extracts and/or capsules that are imported, exported, manufactured, packaged, distributed, marketed and/or sold by Ideasphere. The phrase "traditional patent medicines" above is used herein as defined by the California Department of Health Services: "herbal and patent medicines consisting of single or multiple herbal ingredients, including botanical, mineral and animal products, formulated into tablets, pills, powders and liquids." The products that are the subject of this notice include but are not limited to the following:

#### Product Chemical

**Dandelion-Goldenseal Combination** Elderberry Echinacea/Goldenseal Combination lead and lead compounds Red Rasberry Combination Femchange

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds



Black Walnut Burdock Root Butchers Broom Cavenne

Dandelion Root

Maca

Hawthorn (Flower, Leaf & Berry)

Nettle Leaf Sarsaparilla Valerian Root Eyebright

Echinacea Angustifolia

**Elderberry Flowers & Berries** 

Red Clover Willowprin

Ginger-Peppermint Combination Garlic-Cayenne Combination Hops-Valerian Combination Juniper Berry Combination

Chickweed

Fenugreek & Thyme

Ginger Root

Eleutherococcus Root Goldenseal Herb Goldenseal Root Gotu Kola

Scullcap

Slippery Elm Bark White Willow Bark

Yucca

Echinacea Root & Leaf Red Raspberry Leaves Bitter Melon-Power Black Cohosh-Power Black Current-Power Chaste-Berry Power Elderberry-Power

**Echinacea-Goldenseal Power** 

Horse-Chestnut-Power Echinacea-Power Valerian-Power Ginger-Power Ginger Tea-Power

Veno-Care Digest-Ease DGL Power lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds lead and lead compounds

lead and lead compounds

Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. March 3, 2008 Page 3

Ginkgo-Power	lead and lead compounds
Phyto Estrogen-Power	lead and lead compounds
St. John's-Power	lead and lead compounds
Aloe Vera Inner Leaf	lead and lead compounds
Bitter Melon	lead and lead compounds
Forskohlii	lead and lead compounds
Celery Seed	lead and lead compounds
Green Tea-Power (caffeine free)	lead and lead compounds
Echinacea-Goldenseal Combination	lead and lead compounds
Sea Kelp	lead and lead compounds

Route of exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and use of these products as recommended by the manufacturer. Accordingly, the consumer exposures have occurred and continue to occur primarily through the ingestion exposure route, but also may occur through inhalation and/or and dermal contact.

**Duration of violations.** Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day for at least March 3, 2007, as well as every day since the products were introduced in the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are removed from the products.

This notice of violation supplements the previous notice of violation issued by AYS against Ideasphere on August 7, 2007, regarding nine products.

Pursuant to Title 11, C.C.R. § 3100, a certificate of merit is attached hereto.

In keeping with its public interest mission and to expeditiously rectify these ongoing violations of California law, AYS is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter without engaging in costly and protracted litigation. Please direct all communications regarding this notice to AYS' counsel in this matter:

Andrew L. Packard, Esq. Law Offices of Andrew L. Packard 319 Pleasant Street Petaluma, CA 94952 Tel: 707-763-7227

Fax: 707-763-9227

Very truly yours,

Larry Fahn

Executive Director

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

(for As You Sow's Proposition 65 Violation on IDEASPHERE, INC. doing business as TWINLAB CORPORATION and NATURE'S HERBS, INC.)

# I, Andrew L. Packard, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party in the notice has violated Health & Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: Mach 3, 2008

Andrew I. Packard

Attachments (for Attorney General copy only)

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is: 311 California Street, Suite 510, San Francisco, CA 94104.

On March 3, 2008, I served the following documents:

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit
- "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary"

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

David Van Andel, CEO IdeaSphere, Inc. doing business as TwinLab Corporation and Nature's Herbs, Inc. 3133 Orchard Vista Dr. SE Grand Rapids, MI 49546	David Van Andel, CEO IdeaSphere, Inc. doing business as TwinLab Corporation and Nature's Herbs, Inc. 600 E. Quality Drive American Fork, UT 84003	David Van Andel, CEO IdeaSphere, Inc. doing business as TwinLab Corporation and Nature's Herbs, Inc. 701 S 600 E American Fork, UT 84003
---	---	--

On March 3, 2008, I served the following document(s):

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit, including Supporting Documentation Required by Title 11, C.C.R. § 3102

on the following party by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

Attn: Ed Weil, Deputy Attorney General California Department of Justice P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On March 3, 2008, I served the following document(s):

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq., including Exhibit A
- Certificate of Merit

on each of the parties on the service list attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the service list attached hereto, and depositing it at United States Postal Service mail box for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on March 3, 2008, at San Francisco, California.

Karaly<del>h P</del>. Buchner

ţ

#### PUBLIC ENFORCEMENT AGENCY SERVICE LIST

THE HONORABLE THOMAS J ORLOFF ALAMEDA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1225 FALLON ST RM 900 OAKLAND CA 94612

THE HONORABLE WILLIAM RICHMOND ALPINE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 248 MARKLEEVILLE CA 96120

THE HONORABLE TODD D RIEBE AMADOR COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 708 COURT ST STE 202 JACKSON CA 95642

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RAMSEY BUTTE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 25 COUNTY CTR DR OROVILLE CA 95965

THE HONORABLE JEFFREY TUTTLE
CALAVERAS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
891 MTN RANCH RD
SAN ANDREAS CA 95249

THE HONORABLE JOHN POYNER COLUSA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 547 MARKET ST STE 102 COLUSA CA 95932

THE HONORABLE ROBERT KOCHLY CONTRA COSTA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 725 COURT ST 4<sup>TH</sup> FLR MARTINEZ CA 94553

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RIESE DEL NORTE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 450 H ST STE 171 CRESCENT CITY CA 95531

THE HONORABLE VERNON PIERSON
EL DORADO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
515 MAIN ST
PLACERVILLE CA 95667

THE HONORABLE ELIZABETH EGAN FRESNO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 2220 TULARE ST STE 1000 FRESNO CA 93721

THE HONORABLE ROBERT HOLZAPFEL GLENN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 430 WILLOWS CA 95988

THE HONORABLE PAUL GALLEGOS HUMBOLDT COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 825 FIFTH ST EUREKA CA 95501 THE HONORABLE GILBERT OTERO
IMPERIAL COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
940 W MAIN ST
EL CENTRO CA 92243

THE HONORABLE ARTHUR MAILLET INYO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX D INDEPENDENCE CA 93526

THE HONORABLE EDWARD R JAGELS KERN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1215 TRUXTUN AVE BAKERSFIELD CA 93301

THE HONORABLE RON CALHOUN KINGS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1400 W LACEY BLVD HANFORD CA 93230

THE HONORABLE JON HOPKINS LAKE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 255 N FORBES ST LAKEPORT CA 95453

THE HONORABLE ROBERT BURNS LASSEN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 220 S LASSEN ST STE 8 SUSANVILLE CA 96130

THE HONORABLE STEVE COOLEY L A COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 210 W TEMPLE ST STE 18000 LOS ANGELES CA 90012-3210

THE HONORABLE ERNEST LICALSI MADERA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 209 W YOSEMITE AVE MADERA CA 93637

THE HONORABLE EDWARD BERBERIAN, JR. MARIN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 3501 CIVIC CTR DR RM 130 SAN RAFAEL CA 94903

THE HONORABLE ROBERT BROWN MARIPOSA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 730 MARIPOSA CA 95338

THE HONORABLE MEREDITH LINTOTT MENDOCINO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 1000 UKIAH CA 95482

THE HONORABLE LARRY MORSE II MERCED COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 2222 M ST MERCED CA 95340 THE HONORABLE GARY WOOLVERTON MODOC COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 204 S COURT ST RM 202 ALTURAS CA 96101-4020

THE HONORABLE GEORGE BOOTH MONO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 617 BRIDGEPORT CA 93517

THE HONORABLE DEAN FLIPPO MONTEREY COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 1131 SALINAS CA 93902

THE HONORABLE GARY LIEBERSTEIN NAPA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 931 PARKWAY MALL NAPA CA 94559

THE HONORABLE CLIFFORD NEWELL NEVADA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 201 CHURCH ST STE 8 NEVADA CITY CA 95959

THE HONORABLE TONY RACKAUCKAS ORANGE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 401 CIVIC CTR DR WEST SANTA ANA CA 92701

THE HONORABLE BRAD FENOCCHIO PLACER COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 11562 B AVE AUBURN CA 95603

THE HONORABLE JEFF CUNAN
PLUMAS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
520 MAIN ST RM 404
QUINCY CA 95971

THE HONORABLE RODRIC PACHECO RIVERSIDE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 4075 MAIN ST RIVERSIDE CA 92501

THE HONORABLE JAN SCULLY SACRAMENTO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 901 G ST SACRAMENTO CA 95814

THE HONORABLE CANDICE HOOPER SAN BENITO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 419 FOURTH ST, FL 2 HOLLISTER CA 95023

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RAMOS SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 316 N MTN VIEW AVE SAN BERNARDINO CA 92415-0004

### PUBLIC ENFORCEMENT AGENCY SERVICE LIST

THE HONORABLE BONNIE DUMANIS SAN DIEGO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 330 W BROADWAY SAN DIEGO CA 92101

THE HONORABLE KAMALA HARRIS SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 850 BRYANT ST RM 325 SAN FRANCISCO CA 94103

THE HONORABLE JAMES WILLETT SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 990 STOCKTON CA 95201-0990

THE HONORABLE GERALD T SHEA SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY CITY GOVERNMENT CTR, 4<sup>TH</sup> FLR SAN LUIS OBISPO CA 93408

THE HONORABLE JAMES P FOX SAN MATEO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 400 COUNTY CTR FL 3 REDWOOD CITY CA 94063

THE HONORABLE CHRISTIE STANLEY SANTA BARBARA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1112 SANTA BARBARA ST SANTA BARBARA CA 93101

THE HONORABLE DOLORES CARR SANTA CLARA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 70 W HEDDING ST WEST WING SAN JOSE CA 95110

THE HONORABLE BOB LEE SANTA CRUZ COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 701 OCEAN ST RM 200 SANTA CRUZ CA 95060 THE HONORABLE GERALD C. BENITO SHASTA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1525 COURT ST FL 3 REDDING CA 96001

THE HONORABLE LAWRENCE ALLEN SIERRA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 457 DOWNIEVILLE CA 95936

THE HONORABLE JAMES ANDRUS SISKIYOU COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 986 YREKA CA 96097

THE HONORABLE DAVID W PAULSON SOLANO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 675 TEXAS ST STE 4500 FAIRFIELD CA 94533

THE HONORABLE STEPHAN PASSALACQUA SONOMA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 600 ADMINISTRATION DR RM 212-J SANTA ROSA CA 95403

THE HONORABLE BIRGIT FLADAGER
STANISLAUS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
PO BOX 442
MODESTO CA 95353

THE HONORABLE CARL V ADAMS SUTTER COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 446 SECOND ST YUBA CITY CA 95991

THE HONORABLE GREGG COHEN TEHAMA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 519 RED BLUFF CA 96080

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL HARPER TRINITY COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 310 WEAVERVILLE CA 96093 THE HONORABLE PHILLIP J CLINE TULARE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 221 S MOONEY BLVD RM 224 VISALIA CA 93291

THE HONORABLE DONALD SEGERSTROM JR TUOLUMNE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 423 N WASHINGTON ST SONORA CA 95370

THE HONORABLE GREG TOTTEN
VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
800 S VICTORIA AVE
VENTURA CA 93009

THE HONORABLE JEFF REISIG YOLO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 301 SECOND ST WOODLAND CA 95695

THE HONORABLE PATRICK MCGRATH YUBA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 215 FIFTH ST MARYSVILLE CA 95901

LOS ANGELES CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 800 CITY HALL EAST 200 N MAIN ST LOS ANGELES CA 90012

SAN DIEGO CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE CIVIC CENTER PLAZA 1200 THIRD AVE STE 1620 SAN DIEGO CA 92101

SAN JOSE CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 200 E SANTA CLARA ST FL 6 SAN JOSE CA 95113

SAN FRANCISCO CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE CITY HALL RM 234 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102